# OPPOSING RACISM IN PAUL HAGGIS' CRASH MOVIE: A SOCIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE



Submitted as a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for Getting Bachelor Degree of Education in English department School Teacher Training Education

by:

## **SAARAH MAHDIYAH**

A320170136

DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH EDUCATION
SCHOOL OF TEACHER TRAINING AND EDUCATION
UNIVERSITAS MUHAMMADIYAH SURAKARTA

## APPROVAL

## OPPOSING RACISM IN PAUL HAGGIS' CRASH MOVIE: A SOCIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE

## PUBLICATION ARTICLE

by:

# SAARAH MAHDIYAH A320170136

Approved to be examined by Consultant School of Teacher Training and Education Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta

Consultant,

unhowich

Dr. M. Thovibi, M. S

NIDN 062095901

## ACCEPTANCE

# OPPOSING RACISM IN PAUL HAGGIS' CRASH MOVIE: A SOCIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE

by:

## SAARAH MAHDIYAH

A320170136

Accepted by Board Examiner of English Education School of Teacher and Training Education Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta On, 26 July 2021

## The board Examiers:

1. Dr. M. Thoyibi, M. S (Head of Exaimer)

2. Dr. Phil. Dewi Candraningrum, M. Ed (Member I of Examiner)

3. Yeny Prastiwi, Ph. D (Member II of Examiner)

Dekan

Jelandy

or Sutama, M.Pd. aK/NIDN 0007016002

## TESTIMONY

I testify that in this publication article there is no plagiarism of previous literary works which been raised to obtain bachelor degree of certain university, nor there are opinions or masterpieces which have been written or published by others, except those in which the writing is referred to the manuscript and mentioned in literary review and bibliography.

Hence later, if it is proven that there are some untrue statements in this testimony, I will fully be responsible.

Surakarta, 26 July 2021

The Researcher

SAARAH MAHDIYAH

A320170136

# OPPOSING RACISM IN PAUL HAGGIS' CRASH MOVIE: A SOCIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE

#### **Abstrak**

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengidentifikasi indikator rasisme dalam film, mendeskripsikan bagaimana sutradara menggambarkan rasisme dalam film dan mengungkapkan alasan mengapa sutradara secara khusus membahas rasisme dalam film tersebut. Film ini termasuk penelitian kualitatif. Sumber data primer penelitian ini adalah film berjudul *Crash*. Sumber data sekunder adalah buku, jurnal, internet dan sumber lain yang mendukung analisis. Teknik pengumpulan data dalam penelitian ini adalah menonton film *Crash* dan mencari sumber data yang sesuai dengan penelitian ini. Penelitian ini menghasilkan beberapa kesimpulan. Pertama, indikator rasisme dalam film. Kedua, hal-hal yang menggambarkan rasisme dari film. Ketiga, mengetahui alasan Paul Haggis membahas rasisme dalam film.

**Kata Kunci** : *Crash*, rasisme, Paul Haggis

#### **Abstract**

The objective of this study is to identify the indicators of racism in the film, to describe how the director portray racism in the film and to reveal the reason why the director specifically discuss racism in the film. This film is belonging to qualitative research. The primary data source of this study is a movie entitled *Crash*. Secondary data sources are the books, journal, internet and other sources that support the analysis. The data collection technique in this study was watching the *Crash* movie and looking for data sources that were in accordance with this research. This study resulted in several conclusions. First, indicators of racism in the film. Second, the things that depict racism from the film. Third, find out why Paul Haggis discussed racism in the film.

Keywords: Crash, racism, Paul Haggis

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Racism is the underestimation or potentially abuse of ethnic minorities dependent on a socially developed racial pecking order that advantages white individuals. *Crash* released in 2004, directed by Paul Haggis, discusses the racism that differentiates blacks and white skin. In the film the director aims to convey how to deal with cultural differences. Because each person is unique, from their respective backgrounds, from the perspective of culture, religion and ethnicity, the social processes that are carried out during life. We should not and do not need to differentiate between people because we do not know what their backgrounds are. The reason I choose this film for my proposal because it is very interesting and useful for me and the reader of my proposal later. Many moral messages that I can receive in the film.

A lot of researchers already used *Crash* movie as the object of their study using various theories as the approach. There is a paper that also has the same issue but it used a different

theory as the approach. here are 10 previous researches which choose *Crash* movie as the object of the study that researcher found and classified into two, namely literature and linguistics. Studies belonging to the linguistics is one article using sociolinguistics analysis by Dindadari Arum Jati (2013) and literature are nine articles An Interpretive Content Analysis used by Kevin Buckler (2008), humanistic psychological approach used by Vike Eka Agustin (2013), psychological approach used by Mibianto, S.T and Setiawan, D. (2013), Cultural Studies used by Wegig Restu Indriawan, (2011) and Sanjay Sharma (2016), Critical Analysis used by Mark P. Orbe and Etsuko Kinefuchi (2008), cultural psychology used by Jane Alexander Stewart (2007), sociological used by Tori Goyette (2011), Hsuan L. Hsu (2006), and Siti Zulaikha Anugrahini Putri (2019). Based on the articles above, the previous studies different with this research paper. In this research paper the writer explains about opposing racism in Paul Haggis' *Crash* movie based on a sociological perspective. The writer analyses how the director's message to opposite racism on the *Crash* movie. The similarity between this research paper with the previous studies is *Crash* movie as the objects and data sources.

The purpose of literary research is to find out the relation between literature and the society context where the literary work was produced discover. Those materials will be studied using sociological perspective. There is a lot of study that raised an issue about racism and this research aims to complement the previous studies.

According to Diana Laurenson and Alan Swingewood (1972, p.13) The sociological study of literature is thus a fairly late arrival, for although there are today well developed sociologies of religion, education, politics, social change, even of such an imprecise area as ideology, there is virtually no established corpus of knowledge. Rene Wellek and Austin Warren (1962, p.110) arranged the relation between literature and society into three sections, the first is the sociological of the author and calling and the establishment of literature. It relates monetary premise of artistic creation, social belief system. The second is the issue of the social substance, the involving and social reason for the work literature themselves and the third is the issues of the crowd and the real impact the literature.

#### 2. METHOD

Type of this research is literary research. The writer utilizes a qualitative research as the method. The method of collecting data the writer using document analysis. There are 5 steps of collecting data watching *Crash* movie repeatedly to understand the story, downloading the transcript of the movie, understanding parts of the related movie also of the work, taking notes

and capturing of important parts in the movie also of the work, classifying the problem and finding data.

#### 3. FINDING AND DISCCUSION

## 3.1 Finding

## 3.1.1 Indicators of Racism

The Indicators of racism in *Crash* Movie is about racial prejudice, racial stereotypes, racial discrimination and racial violence.

## a. Racial Prejudice

Prejudice is an assessment of a group or an individual based primarily on the membership of that group or individual. In racial prejudice, group membership or individual is associated with skin colour and ancestry.

## b. Racial Stereotypes

Racial stereotypes Involves part of a belief system about the distinctive characteristics of members of a particular ethnic or national group, their status, social and cultural norms.

#### c. Racial Discrimination

Discrimination is an action that is carried out based on preconceived notions, and can be interpreted as differentiating attitudes and treatment towards certain community groups due to differences in skin colour.

#### d. Racial Violence

Violence is the act of a person or group of people, causing injury or death to another person or causing physical or property damage to others. Various forms of incidents are classified as violence and crimes because there are violations of the human rights of others that are detrimental.

## 3.1.2 Depiction of Racism

Racism addressed strongly by the author for creating three depictions. They are character, setting, and events.

#### a. Character

Character categories are divided into 3 namely; Racist Characters, Victim of Racism, and Opposing Racism.

#### 1. Racist Characters

In this film, racist characters are represented by Jean, Ryan, Fred, Farhad, Anthony, Lucion, Flanagan.

#### - Jean Cabot

Jean is an antagonistic type of character, she considers all people of a different race with him to be bad people. She seemed to think it was because she was handed a gun by peter when her car was about to be stolen, she complained to her husband in front of the locksmith and housekeeper of Mexican descent. She was suspicious of the locksmith who was of Mexican descent and told her husband "that as soon as the locksmith leaves that he will sell the key to one of his gang banger friends right as he leaves".

## - Officer John Ryan

Ryan is one of the racist white cops, he is a man who wants to be in power. He sexually assaulted Christine while looking for the thief of Jean and Dirck's car. but instead he used the opportunity to harass a black woman. And he also compares whites and blacks because he doesn't feel helped by Shaniqua's answer who is an African-American woman at the time she was consul and was looking for a solution for her father's health. This act made Ryan expelled from Shaniqua's room for words that should not have been conveyed to Shaniqua.

## - Fred

Fred is a television program producer who is racist towards one of the main characters of the program he has created. During his shooting breaks, he followed Cameron who played the lead role in his program. and he rebuked directly about the character changes in the main character who according to Fred tends to have a character like black people. Then, Fred asks him to reshoot the scene.

#### Farhad

Farhad is a man of Persian descent, he is one of the racist people. he is racist towards a Mexican locksmith named Daniel. He accuses Daniel of defrauding him while fixing the keys in his shop, at that time Daniel said that the door was broken, so Farhad had to replace the door. But Farhad did not follow Daniel's words and his shop was robbed by an unknown person. Farhad points a gun at Daniel and demands compensation for the looting that happened to him. Then Daniel gave some money in his wallet to Farhad, but Farhad didn't accept it and Farhad forced Daniel to hand over his car to Daniel while still holding the gun.

## - Anthony

Anthony is a racist character. he feels that his life is unfair because he is black in Los Angeles. He teaches his friend Peter, who was previously non-racist, friendly, and kind to be a racist too. he stole jean and dick's car, to sell it for money. then after accidentally crashing into an Asian, he also steals an Asian car they hit. He also stole Cameron's car and almost got caught by a white cop during their fight, but he survived because Cameron was warned by Tom Hansen.

#### - Lucion

Lucion is a racist character, because he received a car that was sold from the stolen and when he found out in the van in the trunk there were Asian people being kidnapped, he tells Anthony to sell the Asian people in the car and he will give Anthony money.

## Jake Flanagan

Flanagan was a racist character when he spoke to Detective Graham. he tried to persuade graham to say that Conklin killed Lewis. but graham didn't say it. then he gets annoyed and he says "Fucking black people.". if graham said it would benefit D.A.

#### 2. Victim of Racism

In this film, Victim of Racism characters are represented by Christine, Daniel, and Peter.

#### a. Christine

Christine is a victim of sexual harassment by Ryan. Christine and her husband are accused of stealing Jean and Dirck's car. Then while driving to their house she and her husband were stopped on the side of the road for a raid. At first only her husband was raided, because she did not accept Ryan's treatment of her husband until she was annoyed, and then Ryan was angry that made her also raided and touched all over her body by Ryan.

#### b. Daniel

Daniel is a victim of the racism committed by Jean and Farhad. Jean accuses and misbehaves when he fixes the keys to her house. Because Jean is afraid that he will give her house keys to people of the same race as him. then he was also accused by Farhad of harming his shop. so Farhad asked for responsibility for what he did. when in fact Daniel did not harm Farhad at all. Because he didn't want the problem

to get longer he gave some of the money to Farhad, but it was refused until Farhad shot him with a gun that had no bullets.

#### c. Peter

Peter is the victim of a murder committed by Tom. Peter was first looking for a ride, then Tom's car stopped then he hitchhiked and got into Tom's car. They chatted in the car which in the end Tom suspected Peter was hiding something in his hands. Peter tries to convince Tom but Tom shoots straight away until Peter is dead and thrown in the bushes.

## 3. Opposing Racism

Dorri is the daughter of Farhad who is against racism. She is a doctor and knowledgeable. When she accompanied his father to buy a gun, until his father was expelled by the shop owner. She still buys his father a gun but no bullets. This saves Lara's life, the child of Daniel, who was shot by Farhad. Dorri's actions are very positive and are a way of opposing racism.

## 4. Setting

Setting categories are divided into 3 namely; Setting of Place, Setting of Time, and Setting of Situation.

## a. Setting of Place

The setting of the film is in Los Angeles. Los Angeles itself is the biggest city in the province of California by populace and the second most crowded city in the United States, North America.

#### b. Gun Store

In this gun store there was a debate between the shop owner as a white person and Farhad who was a citizen of Persian descent. The shop owner suspects that Farhad bought a gun for jihad. until finally they were noisy and Farhad was expelled from the shop.

## c. The side of the road

On the side of the road, to be exact where Jean and Dirck's car parked. when Dirck was about to enter his car, he was held at gun by Anthony and Peter because they wanted to rob and take his car.

## d. Jean's House

Jean's house, Jean suspects Daniel is one of the members of another race. She was traumatized because she was previously at gunpoint by Peter. She thinks they are the same and She accuses Daniel will give his house keys to his friends.

#### e. Farhad's Store

At Farhad's store, there was racism accusing Farhad of being a citizen of Persian descent against Daniel as a citizen of Mexican descent. Farhad accused Daniel of deceiving him because Daniel was deemed not to have completed his task while fixing the lock on his shop.

## f. Shaniqua' Office

At Shaniqua Johnson's office, there was racism between Shaniqua, a black woman, and Ryan, a white police officer. In their conversation Ryan demeaned Shaniqua because he thought he didn't get a solution for his father's recovery. until Ryan says something that offends Shaniqua and calls security to kick Ryan out from her office.

## g. Meeting Room

In this meeting room, Flanagan was talking to Graham. He's talking about Lewis's murder. Flanagan hopes that Graham will say that it was Conklin who killed Lewis because he was able to make a profit. but Graham didn't say it until Flanagan said "Fucking black people.".

#### h. In front Daniel's house

In front Daniel's house, Farhad points a gun at Daniel and demands compensation for the looting that happened to him. Then Daniel gave some money in his wallet to Farhad, but Farhad didn't accept it and Farhad forced Daniel to hand over his car to Daniel while still holding the gun.

## - Setting of Time

Incidents of racism in the film *Crash* are inspired by true events experienced by Paul Haggis himself, during the robbery of his car while parked in a shop in the Wilshire Boulevard area, Los Angeles, in 1991. This film features many incidents of racism and has a background story about the clashes that happened. And these incidents took place in just two days in Los Angeles, one of the cities in the United States.

## Setting of Situation

In the *Crash* film that depicts racism including racism discrimination, interracial crime, robbery, etc. the situation is bad, scared and panicked. the situation is described by the relationship of the characters who play a role in the film. There is a car robbery incident that causes Jean to panic against other races. Jean's view of other

races has always been bad and she always thought that those of a different race from her could commit crimes against her. A tense situation occurred when Peter, who was the younger brother of Detective Graham, was killed. even though graham had promised his mother to find his missing sister and had not returned home for a long time. but he found the pattern already killed and found among the bushes. This incident really made Graham devastated because he felt guilty for not looking after and looking for Peter.

#### 5. Events

In *Crash* movie, three events related to racism. the events are: robbery, sexual harassment, human trafficking, and murder.

#### a. Robbery

Robbery is the wrongdoing of taking or endeavouring to take anything of significant worth forcibly, danger of power, or by placing the casualty in dread.

## b. Demeaning other races

Begins when Ryan conveys the purpose of his arrival and hopes for a solution to his father's health problems. But Shaniqua couldn't help much in this, because he wasn't a doctor. Hearing Shaniqua's answer, Ryan became emotional and reproached Shaniqua with words that offended Shaniqua. Shaniqua called security to kick Ryan out of his room.

#### c. Sexual Harassment

Sexual Harassment is unwanted lead of a sexual sort, which causes an individual to feel outraged, embarrassed and additionally threatened. Ryan suspects Cameron and Christine of being the blacks who stole Rick and Jean's car. Finally, they were examined and searched, then Ryan was offended by Christine's words to make Ryan act rude to Cameron and Christine. Ryan had sexually harassed Christine, under the pretext of a search, but Ryan instead used the opportunity to touch Christine's body. d. Human Trafficking

# a. Haman Hameking

Human Trafficking is human sales made because of racial differences. The attitude of the shop owner is a criminal act that is classified as a trafficking case, because he wants to trade and buy people who are locked in Anthony's van. This criminal act can be classified as a form of racial violence, because the shop owner

demeaned the Thai or Cambodian people who were in the van by treating them like merchandise.

#### e. Murder

Murder is the wrongdoing of unlawfully killing an individual particularly with malignance aforethought. Peter immediately rushed up in the car which turned out to be Tom's car. They talked in the car, until then Tom started to suspect peter. Peter tries to convince Tom but Tom shoots right away until Peter dies.

## 3.1.3 The Reason of Paul Haggis discussing racism in the movie

Paul Edward Haggis is a Canadian movie and TV screenwriter, producer and director. He is most popular as the screenwriter and producer for sequential Best Picture champs: Million Dollar Child and *Crash*, which he likewise coordinated.

The director discuss racism on this film because experienced himself, during the robbery of his car while parked in a shop in the Wilshire Boulevard area, Los Angeles, in 1991 and this incident happened until now. Especially in America, they still differentiate between races, ethnic groups, and differentiate black and white skin. The director depicts what actually happens in American racism. Black Americans are citizens who must be spaced apart or separated from whites. Minority groups are always considered as citizens who have the potential to make trouble or approach criminal acts. In this film the director wants that this incident can be reduced or not there anymore. Then he gave the message according to what happened in real life and he also showed how to respond to the differences in the film. In this film the director aims to convey how to deal with cultural differences. Because each person is unique, from their respective backgrounds, from the perspective of culture, religion and ethnicity, the social processes that are carried out during life.

#### 3.2 Discussion

According to sociological theory by Diana Laurenson and Alan Swingewood (1972), *Crash* movie is related events experienced by Paul Haggis himself, during the robbery of his car while parked in a shop in the Wilshire Boulevard area, Los Angeles, in 1991. *Crash* is depicts what actually happens in American racism. Black Americans are citizens who must be spaced apart or separated from whites. Minority groups are always considered as citizens who have the potential to make trouble or approach criminal acts. This research focuses how the director's message to opposite racism on the *Crash* movie.

According to the result, the writer found several indicators that displayed racism. It was racial prejudice, racial stereotypes, racial discrimination, and racial violence. First, racial prejudice is people who are prejudiced judge others based on social class or their racial category, and are not based on information or facts about themselves as individuals. Second, racial stereotypes involve part of a belief system about the distinctive characteristics of members of a particular ethnic or national group, their status, social and cultural norms. Third, racial discrimination is an action that is carried out based on preconceived notions, and can be interpreted as differentiating attitudes and treatment towards certain community groups due to differences in skin colour. Fourth, racial violence is the act of a person or group of people, causing injury or death to another person or causing physical or property damage to others.

To depict racism in this research, the writer found theory by Diana Laurenson and Alan Swingewood (1972) based on the sociological perspective. There are three types of sociology of literature: sociology of society, sociology of the author, and sociology of the reader. Here the writer depicted racism addressed strongly by the author for creating three depictions. They are character, setting, and events. Character categories are divided into 3 namely; racist characters, victim of racism, and opposing racism. Setting categories are divided into 3 namely; setting of places, setting of time, and setting of situations. Events related to racism divided into 5 the events are; accident, robbery, sexual harassment, human trafficking, murder.

In this case, the main character, Ryan who is one of the racist white cops, he is a man who wants to be in power. He sexually assaults Christine while searching for car thieves Jean and Dirck. but instead he used the opportunity to harass a black woman. And he also compared whites and blacks because he didn't find it helpful to answer Shaniqua who was an African-American woman at the time she was consul and was looking for a solution for her father's health. This act caused Ryan to be kicked out of Shaniqua's room for words that should not have been said to Shaniqua. but he is also responsible for his duties as a policeman. Even though he previously abused Christine, one day in an accident, Christine's car flipped over, causing Christine to be trapped in her car and unable to save herself. when Ryan came he went straight to the overturned car because he was worried that the car would catch fire due to friction and fuel that had spilled on the road. When he wanted to help Christine, Christine felt scared and traumatized because she had previously been abused by Ryan. until Ryan convinces Christine that he just wants to help her survive and get out of the car. in the end the fire was heading to Christine's car but Ryan was still able to save Christine's life.

In this study the writer found out the reason of Paul Haggis as the director of this film specifically discuss racism because of his experienced, during the robbery of his car while parked in a shop in the Wilshire Boulevard area, Los Angeles, in 1991 and this incident happened until now. The director depicts what actually happens in American racism. Black Americans are citizens who must be spaced apart or separated from whites. Minority groups are always considered as citizens who have the potential to make trouble or approach criminal acts. In this film the director wants that this incident can be reduced or not there anymore.

This research aim is to complement the previous studies which use *Crash* movie as the object. There is a previous study which similar to this research but it uses different approach. The title of the research is *Racial Discrimination on Paul Haggis Crash* by Siti Zulaikha. The different between this research and Siti Zulaikha Research is on the theory. This research uses theory by Diana Laurenson and Alan Swingewood meanwhile Siti Zulaikha's Research uses theory of racial discrimination by Rebbeca Blank.

#### 4. CLOSING

The conclusion of this research is consisting of three problem statements. They are: the indicators of racism in Crash, depiction of racism in Crash, and the reason of Paul Haggis discuss specifically racism in Crash. First, the indicators of racism in Crash movie are divided into 4; racial prejudice, racial stereotype, racial discrimination, and racial violence. Racial prejudice is people who are prejudiced judge others based on social class or their racial category, and are not based on information or facts about themselves as individuals. Racial stereotypes involve part of a belief system about the distinctive characteristics of members of a particular ethnic or national group, their status, social and cultural norms. Racial discrimination is an action that is carried out based on preconceived notions, and can be interpreted as differentiating attitudes and treatment towards certain community groups due to differences in skin colour. Racial violence is the act of a person or group of people, causing injury or death to another person or causing physical or property damage to others. Second, the writer depicted racism addressed strongly by the author for creating three depictions. They are character, setting, and events. Character categories are divided into 3 namely; racist characters, victim of racism, and opposing racism. Setting categories are divided into 3 namely; setting of places, setting of time, and setting of situations. Events related to racism divided into 5 the events are; accident, robbery, sexual harassment, human trafficking, murder. Third, in this study the writer found out the reason of Paul Haggis as the director of this film specifically discuss racism because of his experienced, during the robbery of his car while parked in a shop

in the Wilshire Boulevard area, Los Angeles, in 1991 and this incident happened until now. The director depicts what actually happens in American racism. Black Americans are citizens who must be spaced apart or separated from whites. Minority groups are always considered as citizens who have the potential to make trouble or approach criminal acts. In this film the director wants that this incident can be reduced or not there anymore.

#### REFERENCE

- Buckler, K. (2008). Minimizing white race-based behavior and neutralizing oppression discourse: an interpretive content analysis of crash (2005). *Journal of Criminal Justice and Popular Culture*, 15(1).
- Goyette, T. (n.d.). White power: an analysis of racial tensions in Crash.
- Hsuan, L. H. (2006). racial privacy, the l.a. ensamble film, and paul haggis's Crash. Wilson Web.
- Indriawan, W. R. (2011). *Melting pot absurdity in american culture as revealed in paul haggis's movie crash.* semarang state university.
- Jati, D. A. (2013). A sociolinguistic analysis of cross cultural communication style choice as reflected in the script of Crash.
- Laurenson, D., & Swingewood, A. (1972). The sociology of literature.
- Mibianto, S. T., & Setiawan, D. (n.d.). The reactions of the minority toward racism in crash.
- Michael Quinn, P. (2002). Qualitative research & evaluation method. In *Qualitative Inquiry*. http://books.google.com/books/about/Qualitative\_research\_and\_evaluation\_meth.html?i d=FjBw2oi8El4C
- Miles and Huberman. (1994). Qualitative data analysis.
- Orbe, M. P., & Kinefuchi, E. (2008). Crash under investigation: engaging complications of complicity, coherence, and implicature through critical analysis. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 25(2), 135–156. https://doi.org/10.1080/15295030802032275
- Rene Wellek and Austin Warren. (2014). Theory of literature. In *Theory of Literature*. http://digilib.uinsby.ac.id/20072/1/Theory of literature.pdf
- Sharma, S. (2010). "Crash" towards a critical pedagogy of whiteness? *Cultural Studies*, 24(4), 533–552. https://doi.org/10.1080/09502380903494540

- Stewart, J. A. (2007). Crash: a transformative experience. *Jung Journal: Culture and Psyche*, *1*(2), 55–64. https://doi.org/10.1525/jung.2007.1.2.55
- Vike Eka Agustin. (2013). *An analyis of racism in paul haggis' crash film*. University of Muhammadiyah Malang.
- Wilson, william julius. (1999). The bridge over the racial divide: rising inequality and coalition politics.
- Zulaikha, S., & Putri, A. (2019). *Racial discrimination in paul haggis' crash*. Diponegoro University.