

**SUBTITLING STRATEGY ON ENGLISH TO INDONESIA  
IN *TOY STORY 4* MOVIE**



**Submitted as a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Getting Bachelor Degree in  
Department of English Education**

**By:**

**RETNO AYU LISTYANINGRUM**  
**A320160269**

**DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH EDUCATION  
SCHOOL OF TEACHING TRAINING AND EDUCATION  
MUHAMMADIYAH UNIVERSITY OF SURAKARTA  
2020**

**APPROVAL**

**SUBTITLING STRATEGY ON ENGLISH TO INDONESIA  
IN *TOY STORY 4* MOVIE**

**PUBLICATION ARTICLE**

Proposed by:  
RETNO AYU LISTYANINGRUM  
A320160269

Approved to be examine by Consultant

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Dwi Haryanti', written in a cursive style.

Dr. Dra. Dwi Haryanti, M. Hum

**ACCEPTANCE**

**SUBTITLING STRATEGY ON ENGLISH TO INDONESIA  
IN *TOY STORY 4* MOVIE**

**PUBLICATION ARTICLE**

**By:**

**RETNO AYU LISTYANINGRUM**  
**A320160269**

Accepted by the Broad Examiners English Department  
School of Teacher Training and Education  
Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta  
On November, 2020

The Board of Examiners:

- |                                                         |                                                                                          |
|---------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Dr. Dwi Haryanti, M. Hum.<br>Head of Examiner        | (  )  |
| 2. Dr. Anam Sutopo, M.Hum<br>Member I of Examiner       | (  ) |
| 3. Dra. Muamaroh, M.Hum., Ph.D<br>Member II of Examiner | (  ) |



Dean

**Prof. Dr. Harun Djoko Pravitno, M.Hum.**

**NIP. 196504281993030**

## **PRONOUNCEMENT**

Herewith, I state in the articles of this publication that there is no plagiarism from previous research to obtain a bachelor's degree, or there are opinions or works, written or published by other people, except those whose writings are referred to. Manuscripts and quoted in the text are mentioned in the bibliography.

If later it is proven that there are statements that are untrue and plagiarism in this testimony, then I am willing to take full responsibility.

Surakarta, 19 November 2020

The Researcher



Retno Ayu Listyaningrum

A320160269

# **SUBTITLING STRATEGY ON ENGLISH TO INDONESIA IN *TOY STORY 4* MOVIE**

## **Abstrak**

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah (1) mengklasifikasi jenis-jenis strategi terjemahan yang terdapat pada film *Toy Story 4* dan (2) mendeskripsikan ketepatan terjemahan tersebut dalam naskah film *Toy Story 4*. Deskriptif kualitatif digunakan dalam jenis penelitian ini. Data penelitian berupa tuturan tertulis pada naskah film *Toy Story 4* berbahasa Inggris dan Indonesia. Teknik analisis data menggunakan teori Gottlieb (1992) yang berkaitan dengan strategi terjemahan dan teori Nababan, Nuraeni dan Sumardiono (2012) terkait dengan penilaian akurasi. Hasil data yang terkumpul adalah 488 terkait dengan jenis subtitling. Berdasarkan data hasil penelitian dari teori Gottlieb menunjukkan bahwa terdapat 8 strategi terjemahan yang terdapat pada naskah film *Toy Story 4* berbahasa Inggris dan Indonesia yaitu ekspansi 34 (6,96%), parafrase 23 (4,71%) transfer 280 (57,37%), imitasi 35 (7,17%), transkripsi 1 (0,20%), kondensasi 7 (1,43%), deleksi 107 (21,92%) dan pengunduran diri 1 (0,20%). Pada data kedua diperoleh hasil akurasi, 366 (75%) akurat, 113 (23,15%) kurang akurat, dan 9 (1,84%) tidak akurat.

Kata kunci: strategi terjemahan, film, akurasi, ucapan

## **Abstract**

The objectives of this study were (1) classify the types of subtitling strategy contained in the movie *Toy Story 4* and (2) describe the accuracy of the translation in the *Toy Story 4* movie script. Qualitative descriptive is used in this type of research. The research data are written utterances in the *Toy Story 4* movie script in English and Indonesian. The data analysis technique uses the theory of Gottlieb (1992) related to subtitling strategy and the theory of Nababan, Nuraeni and Sumardiono (2012) related to accuracy assessment. The results of the collected data are 488 related to the type of subtitling. Based on the analyzed data, the results of research from Gottlieb's theory show that there are 8 subtitling strategies contained in the *Toy Story 4* movie script in English and Indonesian, namely 34 (6,96%) expansion, 23 (4,71%) paraphrase, 280 (57,37%) transfer, 35 (7,17%) imitation, 1 (0,20%) transcription, 7 (1,43%) condensation, 107 (21,92%) deletion, and 1 (0,20%) resignation. The second finding show that, 366 (75%) accurate, 113 (23,15%) less accurate, and 9 (1,84%) inaccurate.

Keywords: subtitling strategy, movie, accuracy, utterance

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

Translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL) (Catford, 1965, p.20). Which means the translation focuses on the meaning contained in the sentence or text. The meaning is very important to understand the text because we can know the difference between the implied and explicit meanings. Translations can be written or oral, depending on what we will translate later.

Translation is not only crossing the two languages or more, because it needs some factors influencing the result or quality of translation (Sutopo&Priyitno, 2020). The translation is done with the right accuracy so that the translation results come out in accordance with what is desired. So accuracy is very important in the aspect of translation.

Shuttleworth & Cowie (1997: 3) said that the accuracy of a term used in evaluating translations to refer to the extent to which the translations match the original. Accuracy is an act of evaluation in translation.

Usually the translator can translate every utterance as well as the doer. The meaning of utterance is the meaning of the sentence plus the meaning of the situation: time and place, the people involved, their background, their relationship to each other, and what they know about each other (Kreidler, 1998, p. 27). This is often found in dialogues in movie because they are interconnected with the situation and the relationship they are experiencing. Translators must be careful with every utterance and sentence in the dialogue that will affect the storyline. The translator should not only translate the language itself, but also the culture in which the story or novel is taking place. The translator should have broad knowledge of the source and target languages (Sutopo, Maudy, Hanifa, 2020).

Subtitles are defined as a complement to the original soundtrack by adding written text on the screen (O'Connell, 2000: 169) in Simanjuntak & Basari (2016). Which is usually used in films to translate the meaning of each dialogue into the target language. Subtitles are not only in movies but can be found on television shows about foreign countries, novels, songs, and so forth. In addition, subtitles provide a role in the contribution of film and TV programs. Of course, it helps the listener and the audience to enjoy the program that is presented comfortably. The existence of subtitles in the bottom of the screen helps the listener easily understand what is meant in the story and the listener does not feel wrong in interpreting the event.

According to Gottlieb (1997: 71-72) in (Bartoll, 2004) characterizing subtitles from a linguistic and technical perspective: Linguistically: 1. Intralingual subtitles, in the same language. Subtitles from local programs, subtitles in the same language for the hearing impaired and the hearing impaired, and subtitles for people learning languages are included in this group. This program is common on local TV shows that provide someone below the screen to facilitate the audience with physical disabilities. Subtitles between languages, between two languages. This subtitling is usually found on the film provided below the screen.

*Toy Story 4* movie tells about toys with close friendships and a sense of being like family. It is said when the owner of this toy will enter school in Kindergarten. The toys were worried that the owner would get into trouble there, until finally the owner made his own toys and felt comfortable returning to Kindergarten. However, the toy feels itself

inappropriate and always runs away until the toy manages to escape. The old toys finally decided to look for them and struggle to find these toys for their owners.

With the development of the world of movie in the world, more and more movies are made in various genres and languages that vary in each country. Because of this appearance, many translators translated into movies. Movies accelerate very fast, so some movies have to be translated into other languages for various reasons. The movie itself is used as a place for translators to translate in various languages, many translations use strategies in each translation. From the *Toy Story 4* movie which was used as the object of research with an interesting story, the writer decided that he wanted to research deeper into the strategy in the movie.

In translating, not everything that is translated must be in accordance with what is said every sentence or word. A translator must be thorough and in accordance with what is intended in the discussion. Sometimes in each subtitle there are differences and similarities in every dialogue being discussed. According to (Gottlieb. 1992) there are 10 strategies in subtitles, namely: Expansion (Extended expression, adequate rendering, when the source language needs explanation because cultural nuances cannot be re-explained in the target language), Paraphrase (Modified expression, adequate rendering, used when the translator does not use the same rules in translating dialogue), Transfers (full expression, sufficient rendering to translate source text completely and accurately), Imitation (Identical expressions, similar translations usually associated with names of people and places), Transcriptions (Unreasonable expressions, translations that use which term unusual even in the source text, for example the use of a third language or a language difficult to translate), Dislocation (different expressions, adapted content used when using some kind of special effect, for example in a silly song in a cartoon where the effect being translated is more important than content), Condensation (Ex thick presi, short rendering to make text briefly to skip speech that is not important but the message is still the same, Decimation (Expression summary, reduced content in dialogue to translate, indicated there is a scene of actors fighting with fast speaking tempo), Deletion (Expressions omitted, or total deletion of part of the text), and Resignation (Different expression, 'distorted and untranslated content') or when no translation solution could be found and definite meaning was lost). In providing subtitles, translators can use the strategy applied by Gottlieb as an application. For example subtitling strategy of transfer on *toy story 4* movie script :

*Source Language : You never asked.*

*Target Language : kau tak pernah tanya.*

In the translation process using a transfer strategy because all words in the source language are translated properly and correctly. There is no addition or deletion of words in the target language. and there is no word change from SL to TL. The Indonesian language source dialogue and text refer to the same meaning and message.

Researcher extracted data from this study from the *Toy Story 4* movie script. The movie was produced by Pixar Animation Studios, and released by Walt Disney Pictures. This movie is certainly always popular with children and adults because it is proven to have come out the fourth time with a different story and problem. Researchers will focus on subtitling strategies on dialogue and speech and also accuracy contained in English and Indonesian movie scripts.

Research on subtitling strategies and accuracy related to previous research includes, first from Ratusmanga & Napu (2019) with the title *An Analysis of Subtitling Strategies: A Case of English and Indonesian Language Pair*. This study aims to determine the subtitle strategy contained in Ride Along Movie in English subtitles to Indonesian subtitles. Second, Akbar (2016) with the title *An Analysis Of Subtitling Strategy Used In The Revenant Movie (2015)*. The purpose of this study was to identify the subtitle strategy and describe the quality of the subtitles from the The Revenant movie (2015). Third, from Ghaemi & benyamin (2011) with the title *Strategies Used in the Translation of Interlingual Subtitling*. This study aims to identify the interlingual strategy used to translate the English translation text into Persian and to determine how frequent it is.

Based on previous research, There are similarities and differences between previous studies and this study. The similarities is analyzing subtitling strategy and accuracy. Meanwhile, the distinguishes it is the use of a film script to analyze data indirectly from the film but from the dialogue spoken by the characters in written form.

## **2. METHOD**

This type of research used descriptive qualitative. The object of this research is subtitling strategy and accuracy on *Toy Story 4* movie script. The research data includes all the words found in the *Toy story 4* movie script. The research data used English and Indonesian subtitling of *Toy Story 4* movie script as the data source in the study. For data collection techniques, researchers used the documentation research method which was then consulted with the expert judgment. In analyzing the data, the researcher used Gottlieb's (1992) theory to classify the subtitling strategy and the theory of Nababan,

Nuraeni and Sumardiono (2012) in a journal (Agriani, Nababan, & Djatmika, 2018) to analyze the level of accuracy.

### 3. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

This section includes findings and discussion. The sub-chapter explains the results of the data that has been done.

#### 3.1 Finding

In this study, the researcher found 7 types of subtitling strategies and the degree of accuracy that had been found in the data.

##### 3.1.1 The Type of Subtitling Strategy Found in *Toy Story 4* Movie and Its Subtitle.

Found 7 types of subtitling strategies used in the *Toy Story 4* movie script, including paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, condensation, deletion, and resignation.

Table 1. Data Type of Subtitling Strategy

| No.          | Type of Subtitling Strategy | Frequency | Percentage (%) |
|--------------|-----------------------------|-----------|----------------|
| 1.           | Expansion                   | 34        | 6,96%          |
| 2.           | Paraphrase                  | 23        | 4,71%          |
| 3.           | Transfer                    | 280       | 57,37%         |
| 4.           | Imitation                   | 35        | 7,17%          |
| 5.           | Transcription               | 1         | 0,20%          |
| 6.           | Condensation                | 7         | 1,43%          |
| 7.           | Deletion                    | 107       | 21,92%         |
| 8.           | Resignation                 | 1         | 0,20%          |
| <b>TOTAL</b> |                             | 488       | 100%           |

##### 1) Expansion

The strategy used when the source language needs another explanation.

Code 412/TS4/SL/TL27

*Source language:*

*Target language: Ini benar kau!*

The data shows that expansion. In the previous data, Woody was tumbling in the dirt. Bo laughs and helps him up. Even though there is no data in the source language, the target language data answers based on that data.

##### 2) Paraphrase

Is the strategy used to provide more explanation is found in target language.

Code 0331/TS4/SL36/TL22

SL: *Well...I try to stay active.*

TL: *Kucoba sebisa mungkin untuk tetap aktif.*

The data uses a paraphrasing strategy. It appears that among the source languages there are additional words in the target language. Although the message and its meaning have not changed, the additional words provided by the translator are still acceptable. The previous data shows that there is a sentence that will clarify the data above, namely ‘**You are in very good condition**’. This sentence makes the translator do additional words to confirm the data above and make it easier for the reader to understand the meaning of the data above.

### 3) Transfer

Transfer is the strategies used in the translation process are carried out accurately and accurately from the source language to the target language.

Code 0251/TS4/SL29/TL17

SL: --*I mean, Bonnie! You have to be there for Bonnie. That is your job.*

TL: *Maksudku, Bonnie. Kau harus hadir untuk Bonnie. Itu tugasmu.*

The translator uses a transfer strategy. Seen in Code 0251 / TS4 / SL29 / TL17 shows that the data is translated accurately and is done word for word. So that the message and meaning is conveyed by the reader later.

### 4) Imitation

Imitation is a strategy that involves rewriting which is usually a person's name or place name.

Code 0109/TS4/SL13/TL07

SL: *Pricklepants-*

TL: *Pricklepants.*

In the data, there is no change between SL and TL which indicates that the imitation strategy is because the data is the name of the actor in the story. So that the meaning does not change and the message is clear.

### 5) Transcription

Transcription is strategy used in the source language to the target language is by using a third language or a language that is difficult to translate but the writing is the same as the source language.

Code 0395/TS4/SL42/TL26

Source language: *Rad.*

Target language: *Keren.*

The word "rad" according to the oxford dictionary, especially North American English, is old-fashioned, a slang which means very good. So that the word is

translated by the translator so that the reader understands the meaning of the sentence even though it is difficult to explain. So, the data uses transcription strategy.

#### 6) Condensation

Condensation is strategy to summarize sentences from source language to target language but not change existing messages.

Code 0333/TS4/SL36/TL22

SL: *Oh, that's really not necessary...*

TL: *Tak perlu.*

These data use a condensation strategy. This data explains that there is compression between SL and TL. The code 0332 / TS4 / SL36 / TL22 previously explained that **‘And look at that, you have a voicebox like me. Benson, show him’**. In the previous data, it is an expression of wanting to see something. So that the translator uses compression to summarize the data to make it clearer in expressing it. However, the message and meaning in the data provided above have not changed, which can still be conveyed clearly.

#### 7) Deletion

Deletion is unnecessary additions or omitted from the source language to the target language.

Code 0036/TS4/SL05/TL02

SL: *Yeah hi, I think I left my keys in here...*

TL: *Sepertinya kunciku tertinggal di sini.*

Data Code 0036 / TS4 / SL05 / TL02 shows that the data is a deletion which shows the deleted part. Deleting words in the data source language because there is already the word I so that the data cannot be highlighted again. However, the data can still be received because the message and meaning from the data can be conveyed.

#### 8) Resignation

Resignation is strategy that is not translated from source language to target language.

Code 0292/TS4/SL32/TL20

Source language: *Hurry!*

Target language: *Hurry!*

Resignation data, because no translation has been done by the translator. And just rewrote the source language which resulted in the data losing its meaning.

### 3.1.2 Subtitling Accuracy of Movie Subtitling in *Toy Story 4* movie script.

In this section, the researcher uses the rating accuracy instrument to assess each data, between accurate, less accurate, and not accurate.

Table 2. Result Translation of Accuracy

| No.          | Level of Accuracy | Frequency | Percentage (%) |
|--------------|-------------------|-----------|----------------|
| 1.           | Accurate          | 366       | 75%            |
| 2.           | Less accurate     | 113       | 23,15%         |
| 3.           | Inaccurate        | 9         | 1,84%          |
| <b>TOTAL</b> |                   | 488       | 100%           |

#### 1) Accurate

The meaning of words, phrases, clauses, sentences or source language text is accurately translated into the target language text.

Code 0142/ TS4/SL18/TL10

SL: *Since school doesn't start for another week, we are going on a road trip!*

TL: *Karena sekolah libur seminggu, kita akan jalan-jalan!*

The data explains the sentences translated into the target language properly and correctly. So that there are no words in the data to confuse. Message and meaning conveyed properly and correctly to readers. So, the data indicated as accurate.

#### 2) Less accurate

The meaning of the source language word, phrase, clause, sentence, or text has been accurately translated into the target language. However, there are still distortions of meaning or even omitted.

Code 0002/TS4/SL01/TL01

Source language: *Whoa! It's raining **cats and dogs** out there! I hope they make it back alright...*

Target language: *Wah! Hujan deras di luar! Semoga mereka pulang dengan selamat.*

The sentence above, source language has been translated less accurate. The words "**cats and dogs**" and "**I**" are omitted. So that the sentence confuses the reader and the message from the data are less complete.

#### 3) Inaccurate

The meanings of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences or source text are not translated accurately in the target text or are even deleted.

Code 0025/TS4/SL03/TL02

SL: *You got it Woody!*

TL: *Siap, Woody!*

In the sentence source language *You got it*, which is translated to *Ready*, there is a shift in meaning. It should be translated in *you understand*. So that the sentence changes the meaning and message that will confuse the reader because the translation of the data is inaccurate.

### **3.2 Discussion**

From the findings of the subtitling strategy and the assessment of the accuracy of the instruments, they have similarities and differences in conducting the research that has been done. Each data collected based on the theory used by researchers has its own criteria. So that the data found can complement this research.

In research that has been conducted by author, this study uses theory from Gottlieb (1992) about subtitling strategy and theory from Nababan, Nuraeni and Sumardiono (2012) in the journal (Agriani et al., 2018) about accuracy assessment instruments.

In previous research that has been described and uses the same theory from Gottlieb and partly also uses Nababan's theory. Previous research has shown different results. So that it can be compared with research that has been conducted by researchers. And the use of objects used is different, so it can be concluded that each analysis has different findings. In this study, researchers found 8 subtitling strategies, namely paraphrasing, transfer, imitation, condensation, deletion, resignation, transcription and decimation. And using Nababan's theory of accuracy (accurate, less accurate, and inaccurate).

This study it is clear that this research supports the research theory in Akbar (2016) which uses the theory of Gottlieb and Nababan as a reference for analyzing data. There are also similarities in this study with previous research, namely the use of the same theory in research, and what distinguishes this study from previous research is the results of the data obtained. In this study, the results are according to the table above, and the use of translation quality only uses accuracy.

#### 4. CLOSING

Based on the data findings, it can be concluded as follows:

From the first objective to classify the types of subtitle strategies contained in the *Toy Story 4* movie and its subtitles using Gottlieb's theory (1992) with expansion 34 (6,96%), paraphrase 23 (4,71%) transfer 280 (57,37%), imitation 35 (7,17%), transcription 1 (0,20%), condensation 7 (1,43%), deletion 107 (21,92%) and resignation 1 (0,20%). The most dominant in the subtitling strategy is transfer.

The results of the second objective to describe the accuracy of film subtitles in the *Toy Story 4* movie script using the theory of Nababan, Nuraeni and Sumardiono (2012) in the journal (Agriani et al., 2018) Found as much data as 488, the data includes accurate 366 (75%), less accurate 113 (23,15%), and inaccurate 9 (1,84%).

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agriani, T., Nababan, M. R., & Djatmika, D. (2018). Translation Quality on Words Containing Spelling, Punctuation and Grammatical Error. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*. 5 (5).
- Akbar, K. (2016). *An Analysis Of Subtitling Strategy Used In The Revenant Movie*(2015). Muhammadiyah University Of Surakarta. Retrieved from <http://v2.eprints.ums.ac.id/archive/etd/48207>
- Bartoll, E. (2014). Parameters for the Classification of subtitles. In Orero. *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. (P. 53). John Benjamins Publishing Company Amsterdam/Philadelphia.
- Catford, J. (1965). *Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford University Press. (P.20). Retrieved from <https://epdf.pub/a-linguistic-theory-of-translationlanguage-and-language-learning.html>
- Ghaemi, F., & Benyamin, J. (2011). *Strategies in the Translation of Interlingual Subtitling*. *Journal Of English Studies Islamic Azad University, Science & Research Branch*, 1(1).
- Gottlieb, H. (1992). Subtitling a ne university disclipine. In C.D Loddegaard, *Teaching Translation an Interpreting*. (P. 87). Benjamin Publisng company amsterdam/philadelphi.
- Ratusmanga, Z., & napu, N. (2019). An Analysis Of Subtitling Strategies: A Case Of English And Indonesian Language Pair. *Euopian Journal Of Applied Linguistics Studies*, 2(1), 38–49. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3368322>
- Simanjuntak, N. V. N & Basari, A (2016). *Subtitling strategies in real steel movie*. 12 (1) Retrieved from [file:///C:/Users/Win10/Downloads/1093-2922-1-SM%20\(1\).pdf](file:///C:/Users/Win10/Downloads/1093-2922-1-SM%20(1).pdf).

- Shuttleworth, M., & Cowie, M. (1997). *Dictionary of Translation Studies*. Manchester: St. Jerome.
- Sutopo, A., Maudy., & Hanifa. (2020). Translation as an Interdisciplinary Subject in Humanity. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*. 12 (2).
- Sutopo, A., & Priyitno, J. H. (2020). The Influence of Vocabulary Mastery, Reading Interest, and Learning Motivation toward Translation Skill. *Universal Journal of Educational Research* 8(1): 297-303.